(Reprinted with amendments adopted on April 22, 2019) FIRST REPRINT A.J.R. 9

ASSEMBLY JOINT RESOLUTION NO. 9–COMMITTEE ON LEGISLATIVE OPERATIONS AND ELECTIONS

MARCH 25, 2019

Referred to Committee on Judiciary

SUMMARY—Proposes to amend the Nevada Constitution to revise provisions governing the selection of justices and judges. (BDR C-949)

FISCAL NOTE: Effect on Local Government: No. Effect on the State: No.

EXPLANATION - Matter in *bolded italics* is new; matter between brackets [omitted material] is material to be omitted.

ASSEMBLY JOINT RESOLUTION—Proposing to amend the Nevada Constitution to revise provisions governing the selection of justices and judges.

Legislative Counsel's Digest:

Under the Nevada Constitution, the justices of the Supreme Court and the judges of the court of appeals and district courts are popularly elected. (Nev. Const. Art. 6, §§ 3, 3A, 5) When a vacancy occurs before the expiration of any term of such a judicial office, the Governor appoints a justice or judge from among nominees selected by the Commission on Judicial Selection. (Nev. Const. Art. 6, § 20) This resolution proposes to amend the Nevada Constitution to provide for the initial appointment by the Governor of the Chief Justice, associate justices and judges, from nominees recommended by the Commission on Judicial Selection and for a justice or judge to automatically succeed himself or herself to a new term only if such succession is recommended by a commission on judicial performance after it has reviewed the justice's or judge's performance.

12 In addition, this resolution proposes to amend the Nevada Constitution to create 13 the permanent Commission on Judicial Performance, provide for the creation of temporary commissions on judicial performance and require the commissions to 14 perform those reviews. The review of each justice or judge must consist of a review 15 16 of the record of the justice or judge and at least one interview of the justice or 17 judge. At the conclusion of this review, the commission must prepare and release to 18 the public a report containing information about the review and a recommendation 19 on the question of whether the justice or judge should succeed himself or herself.

20 If this resolution is passed by the 2019 Legislature, it must also be passed by 21 the next Legislature and then approved and ratified by the voters in an election 22 before the proposed amendments to the Nevada Constitution become effective.





| 1 2 3 | RESOLVED BY THE ASSEMBLY AND SENATE OF THE STATE OF NEVADA, JOINTLY, That a new section, designated Section 22, be added to Article 6 of the Nevada Constitution to read as follows: |
|-------------|--|
| 3 4 | Sec. 22. 1. There is created a permanent |
| 5 | Commission on Judicial Performance of seventeen |
| 6 | members composed of: |
| 7 | (a) The Chief Justice or an associate justice designated |
| 8 | by the Chief Justice; |
| 9 | (b) Eight members of the State Bar of Nevada, a public |
| 10 | corporation created by statute, appointed by its Board of |
| 11 | Governors; and |
| 12 | (c) Eight persons, not members of the legal profession, |
| 13 14 | of whom: (1) Two are appointed by the Governor or his or her |
| 14 | designee; |
| 16 | (2) Three are appointed by the Speaker of the |
| 17 | Assembly or his or her designee; and |
| 18 | (3) Three are appointed by the Majority Leader of the |
| 19 | Senate or his or her designee. |
| 20 | 2. Each judge of the district court must be reviewed by |
| 21 | a temporary commission on judicial performance, composed |
| 22 | of: |
| 23 | (a) The permanent Commission on Judicial |
| 24 | Performance; |
| 25 | (b) Two additional members of the State Bar of Nevada |
| 26 | resident in the judicial district of the judge being reviewed, |
| 27 | appointed by the Board of Governors of the State Bar of |
| 28 29 | Nevada; and (c) Two residents of the judicial district of the judge |
| 29 30 | being reviewed, not members of the legal profession, |
| 31 | appointed by the Governor. |
| 32 | 3. If at any time the State Bar of Nevada ceases to exist |
| 33 | as a public corporation or ceases to include all attorneys |
| 34 | admitted to practice before the courts of this State, the |
| 35 | Legislature shall provide by law, or if it fails to do so the |
| 36 | Supreme Court shall provide by rule, for the appointment of |
| 37 | attorneys at law to the positions designated in this Section to |
| 38 | be occupied by members of the State Bar of Nevada. |
| 39 | 4. The term of office of each appointive member of the |
| 40 | permanent Commission, except the first members, is 8 |
| 41 | years. Each appointing authority shall, as nearly as may be, |
| 42 | appoint half of the members first appointed for a term of 4 |
| 43 44 | years. If a vacancy occurs, the appointing authority shall fill the vacancy for the unexpired term. |
| 44 | ine vacancy jor ine unexpirea term. |





1 5. The additional members of a temporary commission 2 must be appointed when a review is required, and their 3 terms expire when the review has been completed.

6. An appointing authority shall not appoint to the permanent Commission more than half of the body from residents of the same county.

7 7. No member of the permanent Commission may be a 8 member of a commission on judicial selection or the 9 Commission on Judicial Discipline. A member of the 10 permanent Commission may not hold any other elective 11 office.

12 8. When the permanent Commission reviews a justice 13 of the Supreme Court, the Chief Justice or associate justice 14 designated to be a member of the Commission is disqualified and the other members of the permanent 15 16 *Commission shall select a judge of the district court or court* 17 of appeals to take the place of the disqualified member of 18 the Commission for the sole purpose of reviewing the justice 19 of the Supreme Court.

20 And, be it further

4

5

6

21 RESOLVED, That a new section, designated Section 23, be added 22 to Article 6 of the Nevada Constitution to read as follows:

23 Sec. 23. The Chief Justice and associate justices 1. 24 of the Supreme Court, the judges of the court of appeals, 25 and the judges of the district courts shall be appointed by 26 the Governor, pursuant to Section 20 of this Article, for a 27 term of 6 years each, and the persons so appointed shall 28 enter upon the discharge of the duties of their respective 29 offices upon taking the oath of office prescribed by this 30 Constitution.

Commencing with a term of office that expires on or
 after December 31, 2025, each justice of the Supreme Court,
 judge of the court of appeals, or judge of the district court
 who desires to continue service must, on or before July 1
 next preceding the expiration of that justice's or judge's
 term of office, declare their intent to continue service by
 succeeding themselves with a new term.

3. Commencing with all terms of office for each such justice and judge beginning on January 1, 2026, the term of office upon succession pursuant to this Section shall be 6 years.

4. Commencing with all terms of office for each such justice and judge beginning on January 1, 2026, no judge or justice may serve for more than four terms of 6 years in the same judicial office, provided that service in the same



38

39

40 41

42

43

44

45

| 1judicial office before the effective date of this Section shall2not count towards the four-term limitation on service.35. All justices and judges must be periodically reviewed4by a Commission on Judicial Performance. The review must5consist of an examination of the record of the justice or6judge and at least one interview of the justice or judge at7which the Commission discusses with the justice or judge8any areas of performance in which the performance review9suggests improvement might be warranted.106. The Commission on Judicial Performance shall11consider, without limitation, a justice's or judge's:12(a) Knowledge of the law;13(b) Oral and written communication skills;14(c) Ability to perform the duties of the position;15(d) Legal experience;16(e) Judicial temperament;17(f) Professional reputation;18(g) Work ethic; |
|---|
| 5. All justices and judges must be periodically reviewed by a Commission on Judicial Performance. The review must consist of an examination of the record of the justice or judge and at least one interview of the justice or judge at which the Commission discusses with the justice or judge any areas of performance in which the performance review suggests improvement might be warranted. 6. The Commission on Judicial Performance shall consider, without limitation, a justice's or judge's: (a) Knowledge of the law; (b) Oral and written communication skills; (c) Ability to perform the duties of the position; (d) Legal experience; (e) Judicial temperament; (f) Professional reputation; |
| 4by a Commission on Judicial Performance. The review must5consist of an examination of the record of the justice or6judge and at least one interview of the justice or judge at7which the Commission discusses with the justice or judge8any areas of performance in which the performance review9suggests improvement might be warranted.106. The Commission on Judicial Performance shall11consider, without limitation, a justice's or judge's:12(a) Knowledge of the law;13(b) Oral and written communication skills;14(c) Ability to perform the duties of the position;15(d) Legal experience;16(e) Judicial temperament;17(f) Professional reputation; |
| 5 consist of an examination of the record of the justice or judge and at least one interview of the justice or judge at which the Commission discusses with the justice or judge any areas of performance in which the performance review suggests improvement might be warranted. 10 6. The Commission on Judicial Performance shall consider, without limitation, a justice's or judge's: 12 (a) Knowledge of the law; 13 (b) Oral and written communication skills; 14 (c) Ability to perform the duties of the position; 15 (d) Legal experience; 16 (e) Judicial temperament; 17 (f) Professional reputation; |
| <i>judge and at least one interview of the justice or judge at</i> <i>which the Commission discusses with the justice or judge</i> <i>any areas of performance in which the performance review</i> <i>suggests improvement might be warranted.</i> <i>6. The Commission on Judicial Performance shall</i> <i>consider, without limitation, a justice's or judge's:</i> <i>(a) Knowledge of the law;</i> <i>(b) Oral and written communication skills;</i> <i>(c) Ability to perform the duties of the position;</i> <i>(d) Legal experience;</i> <i>(e) Judicial temperament;</i> <i>(f) Professional reputation;</i> |
| 7 which the Commission discusses with the justice or judge 8 any areas of performance in which the performance review 9 suggests improvement might be warranted. 10 6. The Commission on Judicial Performance shall 11 consider, without limitation, a justice's or judge's: 12 (a) Knowledge of the law; 13 (b) Oral and written communication skills; 14 (c) Ability to perform the duties of the position; 15 (d) Legal experience; 16 (e) Judicial temperament; 17 (f) Professional reputation; |
| any areas of performance in which the performance review suggests improvement might be warranted. 6. The Commission on Judicial Performance shall consider, without limitation, a justice's or judge's: (a) Knowledge of the law; (b) Oral and written communication skills; (c) Ability to perform the duties of the position; (d) Legal experience; (e) Judicial temperament; (f) Professional reputation; |
| 9suggests improvement might be warranted.106. The Commission on Judicial Performance shall11consider, without limitation, a justice's or judge's:12(a) Knowledge of the law;13(b) Oral and written communication skills;14(c) Ability to perform the duties of the position;15(d) Legal experience;16(e) Judicial temperament;17(f) Professional reputation; |
| 106. The Commission on Judicial Performance shall11consider, without limitation, a justice's or judge's:12(a) Knowledge of the law;13(b) Oral and written communication skills;14(c) Ability to perform the duties of the position;15(d) Legal experience;16(e) Judicial temperament;17(f) Professional reputation; |
| 11consider, without limitation, a justice's or judge's:12(a) Knowledge of the law;13(b) Oral and written communication skills;14(c) Ability to perform the duties of the position;15(d) Legal experience;16(e) Judicial temperament;17(f) Professional reputation; |
| 12(a) Knowledge of the law;13(b) Oral and written communication skills;14(c) Ability to perform the duties of the position;15(d) Legal experience;16(e) Judicial temperament;17(f) Professional reputation; |
| 13 (b) Oral and written communication skills; 14 (c) Ability to perform the duties of the position; 15 (d) Legal experience; 16 (e) Judicial temperament; 17 (f) Professional reputation; |
| 14(c) Ability to perform the duties of the position;15(d) Legal experience;16(e) Judicial temperament;17(f) Professional reputation; |
| 15 (d) Legal experience; 16 (e) Judicial temperament; 17 (f) Professional reputation; |
| 16(e) Judicial temperament;17(f) Professional reputation; |
| 17 (f) Professional reputation; |
| |
| 19 (a) Work athia: |
| |
| 19 (h) Commitment to access to justice for all; and |
| 20 (i) Other such areas as directed by the Legislature |
| 21 through law or the Court through rulemaking. |
| 22 The Commission shall not consider the justice's or |
| 23 <i>judge's political affiliation or any consideration prohibited</i> |
| 24 by law. |
| 25 7. At the conclusion of the review closest to the |
| 26 expiration of the justice's or judge's term of office, the |
| 27 members of the Commission must vote on the question of |
| 28 whether the Commission recommends that the justice or |
| 29 judge succeed himself or herself. |
| 30 8. Not later than 6 weeks after the completion of the |
| 31 review by the Commission on Judicial Performance, the |
| 32 Commission shall prepare and release to the public a report |
| 33 that provides a summary of the findings of the Commission, |
| 34 the recommendation of the Commission on the question of |
| 35 whether the justice or judge should succeed himself or |
| 36 <i>herself, the rationale for the recommendation and the result</i> |
| 37 of the vote by which the Commission made the |
| 38 recommendation. The vote of an individual member of the |
| 39 <i>Commission must not be disclosed to the public.</i> |
| 40 9. If the justice or judge receives the recommendations |
| 41 of 13 or more members of the Commission, that judge or |
| 42 justice shall automatically succeed himself or herself to a |
| 43 <i>new term of office.</i> |
| 44 10. If the justice or judge receives the recommendation |
| 45 of at least 9, but fewer than 13 members of the Commission, |
| |





shall not automatically succeed to a new term of office, that office shall be open for appointment through the Commission on Judicial Selection pursuant to Section 20 of this Article, but the justice or judge is eligible to seek reappointment to the next term through the Commission.

6 11. If fewer than 9 members of the Commission on 7 Judicial Performance recommend that a justice or judge 8 succeed himself or herself to a new term of office, that 9 justice or judge shall be ineligible to seek reappointment to 10 the next term through the Commission on Judicial Selection 11 under Section 20 of this Article, but is not barred from 12 seeking appointment in the future.

13 12. If a justice or judge does not declare an intent to
14 succeed to a new term, a vacancy is created at the expiration
15 of the term which must be filled by appointment pursuant to
16 section 20 of this Article.

1713. Notwithstanding a vacancy, an incumbent whose18term has expired may hold over in office until the19incumbent, or a new appointee, is confirmed and takes the20oath of office for the next term, but in no event shall an21incumbent whose term has expired hold over in office for22more than 90 days after the expiration of the term.2314. In all instances, the term of a new or reappointed

14. In all instances, the term of a new or reappointed justice or judge shall begin after the occurrence of the vacancy and on the date the oath of office is taken, thus qualifying the individual to serve, but the appointment shall be forfeited if such oath is not taken within 30 days of confirmation.

29 And, be it further

1 2

3

4 5

24

25

26

27

28

30 RESOLVED, That Section 3A of Article 6 of the Nevada 31 Constitution be amended to read as follows:

Sec. 3A. 1. The court of appeals consists of three judges or such greater number as the Legislature may provide by law. If the number of judges is so increased, the Supreme Court must provide by rule for the assignment of each appeal to a panel of three judges for decision.

37 2. [After the initial terms, each judge of the court of 38 appeals must be elected by the qualified electors of this State 39 at the general election for a term of 6 years beginning on the 40 first Monday of January next after the election. The initial 41 three judges of the court of appeals must be appointed by the 42 Governor from among three nominees selected for each 43 individual seat by the permanent Commission on Judicial 44 Selection described in subsection 3 of section 20 of this 45 Article. After the expiration of 30 days from the date on





1 which the permanent Commission on Judicial Selection has 2 delivered to the Governor its list of nominees for the initial 3 judges, if the Governor has not made the appointments 4 required by this Section, the Governor shall make no other 5 appointment to any public office until the Governor has 6 appointed a judge from the list submitted. The term of the 7 initial judges is 2 years beginning on the first Monday of 8 January next after the effective date of this Section, and an 9 initial judge may succeed himself. If there is an increase in the number of judges, each additional judge must be elected 10 by the qualified electors of this State at the first general 11 12 election following the increase for a term of 6 years 13 beginning on the first Monday of January next after the 14 election.

The Chief Justice of the Supreme Court shall appoint
one of the judges of the court of appeals to be chief judge.
The chief judge serves a term of 4 years . [, except that the
term of the initial chief judge is 2 years.] The chief judge may
succeed himself. The chief judge may resign the position of
chief judge without resigning from the court of appeals.

21 [4.] 3. The Supreme Court shall provide by rule for the 22 assignment of one or more judges of the court of appeals to 23 devote a part of their time to serve as supplemental district 24 judges, where needed.

25 And, be it further

26 RESOLVED, That Section 5 of Article 6 of the Nevada 27 Constitution be amended to read as follows:

28 Sec. 5. The State is hereby divided into nine judicial 29 districts of which the County of Storey shall constitute the 30 First; The County of Ormsby the Second; the County of Lyon 31 the Third; The County of Washoe the Fourth; The Counties of 32 Nye and Churchill the Fifth; The County of Humboldt the 33 Sixth; The County of Lander the Seventh; The County of 34 Douglas the Eighth; and the County of Esmeralda the Ninth. 35 The County of Roop shall be attached to the County of 36 Washoe for judicial purposes until otherwise provided by 37 law. The Legislature may, however, provide by law for an 38 alteration in the boundaries or divisions of the districts herein 39 prescribed, and also for increasing or diminishing the number 40 of the judicial districts and judges therein. But no such 41 change shall take effect, except in case of a vacancy, or the 42 expiration of the term of an incumbent of the foffice. At the 43 first general election under this Constitution there shall be 44 elected in each of the respective districts (except as in this 45 Section hereafter otherwise provided) one district judge, who





1 shall hold office from and including the first Monday of 2 December A.D., eighteen hundred and sixty four and until the 3 first Monday of January in the year eighteen hundred and 4 sixty seven. After the said first election, there shall be elected 5 at the general election which immediately precedes the 6 expiration of the term of his predecessor, one district judge in 7 each of the respective judicial districts (except in the First 8 District as in this Section hereinafter provided.) The district 9 judges shall be elected by the qualified electors of their respective districts, and shall hold office for the term of 6 10 years (excepting those elected at said first election) from and 11 12 including the first Monday of January, next succeeding their 13 election and qualification; provided, that the First Judicial District shall be entitled to, and shall have three district 14 15 judges, who shall possess] office of district judge. In a 16 judicial district with more than one district judge, each 17 judge possesses co-extensive and concurrent jurisdiction, and 18 [who shall be elected at the same times, in the same manner, 19 and shall hold office for the like terms as herein prescribed, in 20 relation to the judges in other judicial districts, any one of 21 said] any of those judges may preside on the [empanneling 22 empaneling] empaneling of grand juries and the presentment 23 and trial on indictments [, under such rules and regulations as 24 may be] in the manner prescribed by law.

25 And, be it further

26 RESOLVED, That Section 15 of Article 6 of the Nevada 27 Constitution be amended to read as follows:

28 Sec. 15. The justices of the Supreme Court, the judges 29 of the court of appeals and the district judges are each entitled 30 to receive for their services a compensation to be fixed by law 31 and paid in the manner provided by law, which must not be 32 increased or diminished during the term for which they have 33 been elected **[]** or appointed unless a vacancy occurs, in which case the successor of the former incumbent is entitled 34 35 to receive only such salary as may be provided by law at the 36 time of his election or appointment. A provision must be 37 made by law for setting apart from each year's revenue a 38 sufficient amount of money to pay such compensation.

39 And, be it further

40 RESOLVED, That Section 20 of Article 6 of the Nevada 41 Constitution be amended to read as follows:

42 Sec. 20. 1. When a vacancy occurs [before the 43 expiration of any term of office] for any reason in the 44 Supreme Court or the court of appeals or among the district 45 judges, [the Governor shall appoint a justice or judge from



among three nominees selected for such individual vacancy by] the Commission on Judicial Selection [.] shall select three nominees for the vacancy within 60 days after the vacancy occurs. The Commission shall provide the names of the three nominees to the Governor and the public. The Governor may:

(a) Appoint a justice or judge from among the three nominees selected for the vacancy by the Commission on Judicial Selection; or

9 10 11

12

13

14

15

16

17

37

38

1

2

3

4 5

6

7

8

(b) Reject all three nominees.

2. After the expiration of 30 days from the date on which the Commission on Judicial Selection has delivered to the Governor its list of nominees for any vacancy, if the Governor has not appointed a justice or judge or rejected all the nominees, the Governor shall make no other appointment to any public office until the Governor has appointed a justice or judge from the list submitted.

18 If the Governor rejects all three nominees selected 3. 19 for the vacancy by the Commission on Judicial Selection, 20 the Commission shall select three additional nominees for 21 the vacancy within 60 days after the date of the rejection. 22 The Commission shall provide the names of the three 23 additional nominees to the Governor and the public. The 24 Governor must appoint a justice or judge from among the 25 three additional nominees selected for the vacancy by the 26 Commission on Judicial Selection.

27 4. After the expiration of 30 days from the date on 28 which the Commission on Judicial Selection has delivered 29 to the Governor its list of additional nominees for any vacancy, if the Governor has not made the appointment 30 31 required by subsection 3, the Governor shall make no other 32 appointment to any public office until the Governor has appointed a justice or judge from the list of additional 33 nominees submitted by the Commission on Judicial 34 35 Selection. 36

5. The *initial* term of office of any justice or judge [so expires on the first Monday of January following the next general election.

39 3.] appointed due to the vacancy of a judicial office
40 before the expiration of a full 6-year judicial term shall be
41 the balance of that judicial term. If the initial term is for a
42 period of three calendar years or less, it shall not count
43 towards the four-term limitation on service. If the initial
44 term is for a period greater than three calendar years, it
45 shall so count.





1 **6**. Each nomination for the Supreme Court or the court 2 of appeals must be made by the permanent Commission, 3 composed of: 4 (a) The Chief Justice or an associate justice designated by 5 him: 6 (b) Three members of the State Bar of Nevada, a public 7 corporation created by statute, appointed by its Board of 8 Governors: and 9 (c) Three persons, not members of the legal profession, 10 appointed by the Governor. 11 4. 7. Each nomination for the district court must be 12 made by a temporary commission composed of: 13 (a) The permanent Commission; 14 (b) A member of the State Bar of Nevada resident in the 15 judicial district in which the vacancy occurs, appointed by the 16 Board of Governors of the State Bar of Nevada; and 17 (c) A resident of such judicial district, not a member of 18 the legal profession, appointed by the Governor. 19 **5.** 8. If at any time the State Bar of Nevada ceases to 20 exist as a public corporation or ceases to include all attorneys 21 admitted to practice before the courts of this State, the 22 Legislature shall provide by law, or if it fails to do so the 23 Supreme Court shall provide by rule, for the appointment of 24 attorneys at law to the positions designated in this Section to 25 be occupied by members of the State Bar of Nevada. 26 [6.] 9. The term of office of each appointive member of 27 the permanent Commission, except the first members, is 4 28 years. Each appointing authority shall appoint one of the 29 members first appointed for a term of 2 years. If a vacancy occurs, the appointing authority shall fill the vacancy for the 30 31 unexpired term. The additional members of a temporary 32 commission must be appointed when a vacancy occurs, and 33 their terms expire when the nominations for such vacancy 34 have been transmitted to the Governor. 35 [7.] 10. An appointing authority shall not appoint to the 36 permanent Commission more than: 37 (a) One resident of any county. 38 (b) Two members of the same political party. → No member of the permanent Commission may be a 39 40 member of *a commission on judicial performance or* the 41 Commission on Judicial Discipline. 42 [8. After the expiration of 30 days from the date on 43 which the Commission on Judicial Selection has delivered to 44 him its list of nominees for any vacancy, if the Governor has 45 not made the appointment required by this Section, he shall



| 1 | make no other appointment to any public office until he has |
|---|---|
| 2 | appointed a justice or judge from the list submitted.] |
| 3 | And, be it further |
| 4 | RESOLVED, That Section 3 of Article 6 of the Nevada |

5 Constitution be repealed.

TEXT OF REPEALED SECTION

Justices of Supreme Court: Election; terms; Chief Sec: 3. The justices of the Supreme Court, shall be elected by the Justice. qualified electors of the State at the general election, and shall hold office for the term of six years from and including the first Monday of January next succeeding their election; provided, that there shall be elected, at the first election under this Constitution, three justices of the Supreme Court who shall hold office from and including the first Monday of December A.D., eighteen hundred and sixty four, and continue in office thereafter, two, four and six years respectively, from and including the first Monday of January next suceeding [succeeding] their election. They shall meet as soon as practicable after their election and qualification, and at their first meeting shall determine by lot, the term of office each shall fill, and the justice drawing the shortest term shall be Chief Justice, and after the expiration of his term, the one having the next shortest term shall be Chief Justice, after which the senior justice in commission shall be Chief Justice; and in case the commission of any two or more of said justices shall bear the same date, they shall determine by lot, who shall be Chief Justice.

30



