

1 **44-48.2-2. Definitions. -- As used in this chapter:**

2 (1) "Evaluation body" means the office of revenue analysis.

3 (2) "Tax expenditure" means any law of the federal government or this state that exempts,
4 in whole or in part, certain persons, businesses, income, goods, services, or property from the
5 impact of established taxes in this state, including, but not limited to, tax exclusions, tax
6 subtractions, tax exemptions, tax deductions, preferential tax rates, tax credits, and tax deferrals.
7 The term "tax expenditure" also refers to exclusion or exemption of services from the sales tax.

8 **44-48.2-3. Sunsets and statement of purpose. --** Notwithstanding any statute or law to
9 the contrary, any act enacted after July 1, 2013, that would create a tax expenditure, renew an
10 existing tax expenditure, or modify an existing tax expenditure shall contain an expiration date of
11 not longer than seven (7) years from the effective date of the new, renewed, or modified tax
12 expenditure. Such acts shall also contain a statement of intent that clearly provides the purpose
13 and objectives of the tax expenditure, including measurable goals in cases where the objectives of
14 the tax expenditure lend themselves to measurement. Any act that is enacted without the
15 provisions required by this section shall not take effect.

16 **44-48.2-4. Analysis of tax expenditures. --** (a) If the revenue loss associated with a tax
17 expenditure exceeds five hundred thousand dollars (\$500,000) in fiscal year 2013 or a succeeding
18 fiscal year, the office of revenue analysis, with the cooperation of the division of taxation, office
19 of management and budget (OMB), shall analyze the use of the tax expenditure on the following
20 schedule to determine to what extent the statute authorizing the tax expenditure has achieved any
21 or all of the purposes identified under subsection (b) of this section:

22 (1) Analyses of tax expenditures existing on July 1, 2013, shall be completed and
23 released under subsection (h) of this section at least once between July 1, 2013 and June 30, 2020,
24 and no less than once every seven (7) years thereafter;

25 (2) Analyses of any tax expenditure created after July 1, 2013, shall be completed and
26 released under subsection (h) of this section within seven (7) years of taking effect, and no less
27 than once every seven (7) years thereafter;

28 (3) Analyses of any tax expenditure with a termination date provided for by law shall be
29 completed and released under subsection (h) of this section between eighteen (18) and thirty-six
30 (36) months before the effective date of termination;

31 (4) Analyses of tax expenditures with similar purposes or objectives shall be scheduled to
32 occur concurrently or in succession, to the extent that doing so does not conflict with the
33 scheduling restrictions outlined under subdivisions (1) through (3) of this section.

34 (b) The analyses under subsection (a) of this section shall, at a minimum, report the

1 following information to the extent that the office of revenue analysis is able to obtain that
2 information on its own or with the cooperation of the division of taxation and other government
3 entities under subsection (g) of this section, and to the extent that reporting such information does
4 not constitute a breach of this state's taxpayer confidentiality laws:

5 (1) The statutory authority for the tax expenditure;

6 (2) The year in which the tax expenditure was enacted;

7 (3) The statement of purpose of the tax expenditure, if one was included in legislation;

8 (4) The likely purpose or purposes of the tax expenditure, based on legislative history and
9 other sources, if the statement of purpose in legislation was absent or vague;

10 (5) A description of the tax expenditure;

11 (6) The state revenue foregone directly as a result of the tax expenditure in the prior fiscal
12 year, as well as estimates of the state revenue that will be foregone in the current and subsequent
13 fiscal years;

14 (7) The local revenue foregone, if any, directly as a result of the tax expenditure in the
15 prior fiscal year, as well as estimates of the local revenue that will be foregone in the current and
16 subsequent fiscal years;

17 (8) The total number of taxpayers who directly benefitted from the tax expenditure in the
18 prior fiscal year;

19 (9) The classes of individuals, types of organizations, or types of industries whose state
20 tax liabilities are directly affected by the tax expenditure;

21 (10) The distribution of the direct benefits of the tax expenditure by taxpayer income
22 level or size of business.

23 (c) The analyses under subsection (a) of this section shall, at a minimum:

24 (1) Present evidence as to whether or not the existence of the tax expenditure has
25 contributed to the achievement of any or all of the purposes identified under subsection (b) of this
26 section;

27 (2) Evaluate the tax expenditure's cost-effectiveness in achieving any or all of the
28 purposes identified under subsection (b) of this section;

29 (3) Identify any unintended effects or beneficiaries of the tax expenditure that are useful
30 in understanding the tax expenditure's overall value and cost-effectiveness;

31 (4) Evaluate the relationship and interactions of the tax expenditure with other tax
32 expenditures or direct spending programs in the same or related budget function.

33 (d) In the case of tax expenditures that the office of revenue analysis determines to be
34 intended to benefit this state's economy, the analyses under subsection (a) of this section shall, at

1 a minimum, also address the following considerations:

2 (1) The extent to which the tax expenditure encouraged beneficial new behavior as
3 opposed to subsidizing behavior that would have occurred regardless of the tax expenditure;

4 (2) Whether and to what extent the tax expenditure may have displaced existing in-state
5 economic activity or harmed existing in-state businesses;

6 (3) The extent to which benefits of the tax expenditure flowed outside the state;

7 (4) The extent to which the economic impact of the tax expenditure remained in state, and
8 the extent to which that in-state impact resulted in further in-state economic gains;

9 (5) The adverse economic impacts associated with other budgetary options that were
10 foregone as a result of offering the tax expenditure.

11 (e) The analyses under subsection (a) of this section shall include specific
12 recommendations to the legislature and the governor as to whether the tax expenditure should be
13 continued without modification, modified, or terminated. Those recommendations shall take into
14 consideration the following:

15 (1) The extent to which continuation of the tax expenditure in its current or modified
16 form would contribute to any or all of the purposes identified under (b) of this section;

17 (2) Whether the tax expenditure could achieve any or all of the purposes identified under
18 subsection (b) of this section in a more cost-effective manner if it were modified, and what those
19 modifications would be;

20 (3) Whether the tax expenditure could be administered more efficiently or enforced more
21 effectively if it were modified;

22 (4) Whether any or all of the purposes identified under subsection (b) of this section
23 could be accomplished in a more cost-effective manner by an alternative policy;

24 (5) Whether the revenue foregone as a result of the tax expenditure is expected to change
25 significantly in future years, and how that change might affect the tax expenditure's cost-
26 effectiveness;

27 (6) Whether the social or economic benefits of the tax expenditure are expected to change
28 significantly in future years, and how that change might affect the tax expenditure's cost-
29 effectiveness;

30 (7) In the case of tax expenditures that the office of revenue analysis recommends for
31 termination, whether that termination should be immediate, delayed, or phased-in gradually;

32 (8) In the case of tax expenditures where the analysis under subsection (a) of this section
33 is significantly limited due to data constraints, whether any changes in statute would facilitate
34 data collection in a way that would allow the office of revenue analysis to better gauge the extent

1 to which the tax expenditure is achieving the purposes under subsection (b) of this section:

2 (9) In the case of tax expenditures where the analysis under subsection (a) of this section
3 is significantly limited due to uncertainty of the purpose of the tax expenditure, whether the
4 effectiveness of the tax expenditure could be determined more definitively if the legislature were
5 to clarify the tax expenditure's intended purpose.

6 (f) To the extent that any of the analyses under subsection (a) of this section are
7 significantly limited due to data constraints, the office of revenue analysis shall, in addition to any
8 changes in statutes recommended under subsection (e) of this section, develop and publish with
9 the analyses under subsection (a) of this section a plan for improving the government's data
10 collection and compilation efforts in a way that will allow the office revenue analysis to conduct a
11 full evaluation that can better gauge the extent to which the tax expenditure is achieving the
12 purposes under subsection (b) of this section, and said expenditure shall be resubmitted for
13 analysis under subsection (a) of this subsection the following year and every subsequent year
14 until full evaluation can be made. Under no circumstances shall the tax expenditure go longer
15 than seven (7) years without receiving a full evaluation under subsection (a) of this section.

16 (g) Pursuant to an analysis under subsection (a) of this section, the recipient of a tax
17 expenditure shall:

18 (1) Provide promptly any information that the office of revenue analysis requests, so long
19 as that request does not conflict with existing taxpayer confidentiality laws;

20 (2) Analyze data in the manner requested by the office of revenue analysis in instances
21 where taxpayer confidentiality laws prevent the recipient of a tax expenditure from sharing
22 information requested by the office of revenue analysis;

23 (3) Otherwise cooperate with the office of revenue analysis.

24 (h) Analyses under subsection (a) of this section must be submitted to the legislature and
25 the governor, and made available on the evaluating body's public website no later than the date
26 specified under subsection (a) of this section.

27 **44-48.2-5. Consideration by the governor. --** The governor's budget submission as
28 required under chapter 35-3 shall identify each tax expenditure for which an analysis was
29 completed in accordance with this chapter in the period since the governor's previous budget
30 submission in one separate budget article. For each tax expenditure, the governor's budget
31 submission shall include a recommendation as to whether the tax expenditure should be
32 continued without modification, modified, or terminated. Where the governor's recommendation
33 differs from those made by the office of revenue analysis in accordance with this chapter, the
34 budget submission shall provide the reasoning behind the governor's recommendation.

1 **44-48.2-6. Legislative consideration.** -- No later than the twentieth (20th) day of the first
2 regular legislative session following the release of the analyses in accordance with this chapter,
3 the house finance committee and the senate finance committee shall hold at least one public
4 hearing to receive testimony regarding the tax expenditures analyzed in accordance with this
5 chapter from the office of management and budget and the general public.

6 SECTION 2. This act shall take effect sixty (60) days after passage.

=====
LC01323
=====

EXPLANATION
BY THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL
OF
A N A C T
RELATING TO TAXATION -- TAX EXPENDITURE EVALUATION ACT

1 This act would impose a procedure for the analysis and evaluation of tax expenditures by
2 the office of revenue analysis.

3 This act would take effect sixty (60) days after passage.

=====
LC01323
=====