♣ Approved for Filing: S.C. Allred
 ♣ 02-14-12 12:23 PM

1	AMENDMENTS REGARDING COMPETENCY TO STAND
2	TRIAL
3	2012 GENERAL SESSION
4	STATE OF UTAH
5	Chief Sponsor: LaVar Christensen
6	Senate Sponsor:
7 8	LONG TITLE
9	General Description:
10	This bill modifies the Code of Criminal Procedure regarding the procedures for
11	determining a defendant's competency to stand trial.
12	Highlighted Provisions:
13	This bill:
14	 modifies the hearing procedure for determining if a defendant is competent to stand
15	trial to $\hat{\mathbf{H}} \rightarrow [\text{include}] \text{ provide} \leftarrow \hat{\mathbf{H}}$ for the court's consideration $\hat{\mathbf{H}} \rightarrow [\text{all available and relevant}]$
15a	$\frac{\text{evidence}}{\text{evidence}}$ the totality of the circumstances $\leftarrow \hat{\mathbf{H}}$,
16	including Ĥ→ [testimony of witnesses who have been in contact with the defendant] testimony of lay
16a	witnesses [; and
17	provides that a defendant who is not restored to competency to stand trial after
18	forensic treatment shall be temporarily detained and undergo civil commitment
19	proceedings] ←Ĥ .
20	Money Appropriated in this Bill:
21	None
22	Other Special Clauses:
23	None
24	Utah Code Sections Affected:
25	AMENDS:
26	77-15-5, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 212
27	Ĥ→ [77-15-6, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 212] ←Ĥ



Ĥ→ [-77-15-6.5, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 212] ←Ĥ

Be it enacted by the Legislature of the state of Utah:

Section 1. Section **77-15-5** is amended to read:

77-15-5. Order for hearing -- Stay of other proceedings -- Examinations of defendant -- Scope of examination and report.

- (1) (a) When a petition is filed pursuant to Section 77-15-3 raising the issue of the defendant's competency to stand trial or when the court raises the issue of the defendant's competency pursuant to Section 77-15-4, the court in which proceedings are pending shall stay all proceedings. If the proceedings are in a court other than the district court in which the petition is filed, the district court shall notify that court of the filing of the petition.
- (b) The district court in which the petition is filed shall pass upon the sufficiency of the allegations of incompetency. If a petition is opposed by either party, the court shall, prior to granting or denying the petition, hold a limited hearing solely for the purpose of determining the sufficiency of the petition. If the court finds that the allegations of incompetency raise a bona fide doubt as to the defendant's competency to stand trial, it shall enter an order for a hearing on the mental condition of the person who is the subject of the petition.
- (2) (a) After the granting of a petition and prior to a full competency hearing, the court may order the Department of Human Services to examine the person and to report to the court concerning the defendant's mental condition.
- (b) The defendant shall be examined by at least two mental health experts not involved in the current treatment of the defendant.
- (c) If the issue is sufficiently raised in the petition or if it becomes apparent that the defendant may be incompetent due to mental retardation, at least one expert experienced in mental retardation assessment shall evaluate the defendant. Upon appointment of the experts, the petitioner or other party as directed by the court shall provide information and materials to the examiners relevant to a determination of the defendant's competency and shall provide copies of the charging document, arrest or incident reports pertaining to the charged offense, known criminal history information, and known prior mental health evaluations and treatments.
- (d) The prosecuting and defense attorneys shall cooperate in providing the relevant information and materials to the examiners, and the court may make the necessary orders to

provide the information listed in Subsection (2)(c) to the examiners. The court may provide in its order for a competency examination of a defendant that custodians of mental health records pertaining to the defendant shall provide those records to the examiners without the need for consent of the defendant or further order of the court.

- (3) During the examination under Subsection (2), unless the court or the executive director of the department directs otherwise, the defendant shall be retained in the same custody or status he was in at the time the examination was ordered.
- (4) The experts shall in the conduct of their examination and in their report to the court consider and address, in addition to any other factors determined to be relevant by the experts:
 - (a) the defendant's present capacity to:
 - (i) comprehend and appreciate the charges or allegations against him;
 - (ii) disclose to counsel pertinent facts, events, and states of mind;
- (iii) comprehend and appreciate the range and nature of possible penalties, if applicable, that may be imposed in the proceedings against him;
 - (iv) engage in reasoned choice of legal strategies and options;
 - (v) understand the adversary nature of the proceedings against him;
 - (vi) manifest appropriate courtroom behavior; and
- 76 (vii) testify relevantly, if applicable;

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68 69

70

71

7273

74

75

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

- (b) the impact of the mental disorder, or mental retardation, if any, on the nature and quality of the defendant's relationship with counsel;
 - (c) if psychoactive medication is currently being administered:
 - (i) whether the medication is necessary to maintain the defendant's competency; and
- (ii) the effect of the medication, if any, on the defendant's demeanor and affect and ability to participate in the proceedings.
- (5) If the expert's opinion is that the defendant is incompetent to proceed, the expert shall indicate in the report:
 - (a) which of the above factors contributes to the defendant's incompetency;
- (b) the nature of the defendant's mental disorder or mental retardation and its relationship to the factors contributing to the defendant's incompetency;
 - (c) the treatment or treatments appropriate and available; and
- (d) the defendant's capacity to give informed consent to treatment to restore

90 competency.

- (6) The experts examining the defendant shall provide an initial report to the court and the prosecuting and defense attorneys within 30 days of the receipt of the court's order. The report shall inform the court of the examiner's opinion concerning the competency of the defendant to stand trial, or, in the alternative, the examiner may inform the court in writing that additional time is needed to complete the report. If the examiner informs the court that additional time is needed, the examiner shall have up to an additional 30 days to provide the report to the court and counsel. The examiner must provide the report within 60 days from the receipt of the court's order unless, for good cause shown, the court authorizes an additional period of time to complete the examination and provide the report.
 - (7) Any written report submitted by the experts shall:
 - (a) identify the specific matters referred for evaluation;
- (b) describe the procedures, techniques, and tests used in the examination and the purpose or purposes for each;
- (c) state the expert's clinical observations, findings, and opinions on each issue referred for examination by the court, and indicate specifically those issues, if any, on which the expert could not give an opinion; and
- (d) identify the sources of information used by the expert and present the basis for the expert's clinical findings and opinions.
- (8) (a) Any statement made by the defendant in the course of any competency examination, whether the examination is with or without the consent of the defendant, any testimony by the expert based upon such statement, and any other fruits of the statement may not be admitted in evidence against the defendant in any criminal proceeding except on an issue respecting mental condition on which the defendant has introduced evidence. The evidence may be admitted, however, where relevant to a determination of the defendant's competency.
- (b) Prior to examining the defendant, examiners should specifically advise the defendant of the limits of confidentiality as provided under Subsection (8)(a).
- (9) When the report is received the court shall set a date for a mental hearing which shall be held in not less than five and not more than 15 days, unless the court enlarges the time for good cause. Any person or organization directed by the department to conduct the

151

121	examination may be subpoended to testify at the hearing. If the experts are in conflict as to the
122	competency of the defendant, all experts should be called to testify at the hearing if reasonably
123	available. The court may call any examiner to testify at the hearing who is not called by the
124	parties. If the court calls an examiner, counsel for the parties may cross-examine the expert.
125	(10) A person shall be presumed competent unless the court, by a preponderance of the
126	evidence, finds the person incompetent to proceed. The burden of proof is upon the proponent
127	of incompetency at the hearing. An adjudication of incompetency to proceed shall not operate
128	as an adjudication of incompetency to give informed consent for medical treatment or for any
129	other purpose, unless specifically set forth in the court order.
130	(11) $\hat{\mathbf{H}} \rightarrow [\underline{(a)} \ \text{The court, in}] \ \underline{\mathbf{In}} \leftarrow \hat{\mathbf{H}} \ \text{determining the defendant's competency to stand trial,}$
130a	$\hat{\mathbf{H}} \rightarrow \underline{\mathbf{the court}} \leftarrow \hat{\mathbf{H}} \underline{\mathbf{shall}}$
131	consider the totality of the circumstances, which Ĥ→ [includes] may include [the information
131a	presented under
132	Subsection (11)(b) the testimony of lay witnesses, $\leftarrow \hat{\mathbf{H}}$ in addition to the expert testimony, studies,
132a	and reports provided under this
133	section.
134	Ĥ→ [(b) The information to be considered by the court shall include all available and
135	relevant evidence, witnesses, and testimony to ensure that there is no manipulation of the
136	process or a wrongful or artificial attempt or motivation on the part of the defendant to avoid
137	being found competent to stand trial.
138	(c) All witnesses and evidence regarding the defendant's personal contact with
139	individuals which may relate to the competency of the defendant to stand trial shall be
140	considered by the court and applied to its determination of the defendant's competency under
141 142	this section.]
142	[(11)] (12) (a) If the court finds the defendant incompetent to stand trial, its order shall contain findings addressing each of the factors in Subsections (4)(a) and (b) of this section.
143	The order issued pursuant to Subsection 77-15-6(1) which the court sends to the facility where
144	the defendant is committed or to the person who is responsible for assessing his progress
145	toward competency shall be provided contemporaneously with the transportation and
147	commitment order of the defendant, unless exigent circumstances require earlier commitment
147	
148	in which case the court shall forward the order within five working days of the order of transportation and commitment of the defendant.
	•
150	(b) The order finding the defendant incompetent to stand trial shall be accompanied by:

(i) copies of the reports of the experts filed with the court pursuant to the order of

152	examination	if not	provided	previousl	y

- (ii) copies of any of the psychiatric, psychological, or social work reports submitted to the court relative to the mental condition of the defendant; and
- (iii) any other documents made available to the court by either the defense or the prosecution, pertaining to the defendant's current or past mental condition.
- [(12)] (13) (a) If the court finds it necessary to order the defendant transported prior to the completion of findings and compilation of documents required under Subsection [(11)] (12), the transportation and commitment order delivering the defendant to the Utah State Hospital, or other mental health facility as directed by the executive director of the Department of Human Services or his designee, shall indicate that the defendant's commitment is based upon a finding of incompetency, and the mental health facility's copy of the order shall be accompanied by the reports of any experts filed with the court pursuant to the order of examination.
- (b) The executive director of the Department of Human Services or his designee may refuse to accept a defendant as a patient unless he is accompanied by a transportation and commitment order which is accompanied by the reports.
- [(13)] (14) Upon a finding of incompetency to stand trial by the court, the prosecuting and defense attorneys shall provide information and materials relevant to the defendant's competency to the facility where the defendant is committed or to the person responsible for assessing his progress towards competency. In addition to any other materials, the prosecuting attorney shall provide:
- (a) copies of the charging document and supporting affidavits or other documents used in the determination of probable cause;
- (b) arrest or incident reports prepared by a law enforcement agency pertaining to the charged offense; and
 - (c) information concerning the defendant's known criminal history.
- [(14)] (15) The court may make any reasonable order to insure compliance with this section.
- 180 [(15)] (16) Failure to comply with this section shall not result in the dismissal of criminal charges.
 - Ĥ→ [Section 2. Section 77-15-6 is amended to read:] ←Ĥ

183	Ĥ→ [77-15-6. Commitment on finding of incompetency to stand trial Subsequent
184	hearings Notice to prosecuting attorneys.
185	(1) Except as provided in Subsection (5), if after hearing[,] the person is found to be
186	incompetent to stand trial, the court shall order the defendant committed to the custody of the
187	executive director of the Department of Human Services or his designee for the purpose of
188	treatment intended to restore the defendant to competency. The court may recommend but not
189	order placement of the defendant. The court may, however, order that the defendant be placed
190	in a secure setting rather than a nonsecure setting. The director or his designee shall designate
191	the specific placement of the defendant during the period of evaluation and treatment to restore
192	competency.
193	(2) The examiner or examiners designated by the executive director to assess the
194	defendant's progress toward competency may not be involved in the routine treatment of the
195	defendant. The examiner or examiners shall provide a full report to the court and prosecuting
196	and defense attorneys within 90 days of arrival of the defendant at the treating facility. If any
197	examiner is unable to complete the assessment within 90 days, that examiner shall provide to
198	${\color{blue} \textbf{the court and counsel a summary progress report which informs\ the\ court\ that\ additional\ time\ is}}$
199	necessary to complete the assessment, in which case the examiner shall have up to an
200	additional 90 days to provide the full report. The full report shall assess:
201	(a) the facility's or program's capacity to provide appropriate treatment for the
202	defendant;
203	(b) the nature of treatments provided to the defendant;
204	(c) what progress toward competency restoration has been made with respect to the
205	factors identified by the court in its initial order;
206	(d) the defendant's current level of mental disorder or mental retardation and need for
207	treatment, if any; and
208	(e) the likelihood of restoration of competency and the amount of time estimated to
209	achieve it.
210	(3) The court on its own motion or upon motion by either party or by the executive
211	director may appoint additional mental health examiners to examine the defendant and advise
212	the court on his current mental status and progress toward competency restoration.
213	(4) Upon receipt of the full report, the court shall hold a hearing to determine the] �-Ĥ

214	H- [defendant's current status. At the hearing, the burden of proving that the defendant is
215	competent is on the proponent of competency. Following the hearing, the court shall determine
216	by a preponderance of evidence whether the defendant is:
217	(a) competent to stand trial;
218	(b) incompetent to stand trial with a substantial probability that the defendant may
219	become competent in the foreseeable future; or
220	(c) incompetent to stand trial without a substantial probability that the defendant may
221	become competent in the foreseeable future.
222	(5) (a) If the court enters a finding pursuant to Subsection (4)(a), the court shall
223	proceed with the trial or such other procedures as may be necessary to adjudicate the charges.
224	(b) If the court enters a finding pursuant to Subsection (4)(b), the court may order that
225	the defendant remain committed to the custody of the executive director of the Department of
226	Human Services or his designee for the purpose of treatment intended to restore the defendant
227	to competency.
228	(c) If the court enters a finding pursuant to Subsection (4)(c), the court shall order [the
229	defendant released from the custody of the director unless the prosecutor informs the court]
230	that commitment proceedings pursuant to Title 62A, Chapter 5, Services [to] for People with
231	Disabilities, or Title 62A, Chapter 15, Substance Abuse and Mental Health Act, will be
232	initiated. These commitment proceedings must be initiated within seven days after the court's
233	order entering the finding in Subsection (4)(c), unless the court enlarges the time for good
234	cause shown. The defendant may be ordered to remain in the custody of the director until
235	commitment proceedings have been concluded. If the defendant is committed, the court which
236	entered the order pursuant to Subsection (4)(c), shall be notified by the director at least 10 days
237	prior to any release of the committed person.
238	(6) If the defendant is recommitted to the department pursuant to Subsection (5)(b), the
239	court shall hold a hearing one year following the recommitment.
240	(7) At the hearing held pursuant to Subsection (6), except for defendants charged with
241	the crimes listed in Subsection (8), a defendant who has not been restored to competency shall
242	be [ordered released or] temporarily detained pending civil commitment proceedings under the
243	same terms as provided in Subsection (5)(c).
244	(8) If the defendant has been charged with aggravated murder, murder, attempted ←Ĥ

243	11-2 [murder, mansiaughter, or a first degree felony and the court determines that the defendant is
246	making reasonable progress towards restoration of competency at the time of the hearing held
247	pursuant to Subsection (6), the court may order the defendant recommitted for a period not to
248	exceed 18 months for the purpose of treatment to restore the defendant to competency with a
249	mandatory review hearing at the end of the 18-month period.
250	(9) Except for defendants charged with aggravated murder or murder, a defendant who
251	has not been restored to competency at the time of the hearing held pursuant to Subsection (8)
252	shall be [ordered released or] temporarily detained pending civil commitment proceedings
253	under the same terms as provided in Subsection (5)(c).
254	(10) If the defendant has been charged with aggravated murder or murder and the court
255	determines that he is making reasonable progress towards restoration of competency at the time
256	of the mandatory review hearing held pursuant to Subsection (8), the court may order the
257	defendant recommitted for a period not to exceed 36 months for the purpose of treatment to
258	restore him to competency.
259	(11) If the defendant is recommitted to the department pursuant to Subsection (10), the
260	court shall hold a hearing no later than at 18-month intervals following the recommitment for
261	the purpose of determining the defendant's competency status.
262	(12) A defendant who has not been restored to competency at the expiration of the
263	additional 36-month commitment period ordered pursuant to Subsection (10) shall be [ordered
264	released or] temporarily detained pending civil commitment proceedings under the same terms
265	as provided in Subsection (5)(c).
266	(13) In no event may the maximum period of detention under this section exceed the
267	maximum period of incarceration which the defendant could receive if he were convicted of
268	the charged offense. This Subsection (13) does not preclude pursuing involuntary civil
269	commitment nor does it place any time limit on civil commitments.
270	(14) Neither release from a pretrial incompetency commitment under the provisions of
271	this section nor civil commitment requires dismissal of criminal charges. The court may retain
272	jurisdiction over the criminal case and may order periodic reviews to assess the defendant's
273	competency to stand trial.
274	(15) A defendant who is civilly committed pursuant to Title 62A, Chapter 5, Services
275	[to] for People with Disabilities, or Title 62A, Chapter 15, Substance Abuse and Mental Health] ←Ĥ

H→ [Act, may still be adjudicated competent to stand trial under this chapter.
(16) (a) The remedy for a violation of the time periods specified in this section, other
than those specified in Subsection (5)(c), (7), (9), (12), or (13), shall be a motion to compel the
hearing, or mandamus, but not release from detention or dismissal of the criminal charges.
(b) The remedy for a violation of the time periods specified in Subsection (5)(c), (7),
(9), (12), or (13) shall not be dismissal of the criminal charges.
(17) In cases in which the treatment of the defendant is precluded by court order for a
period of time, that time period may not be considered in computing time limitations under this
section.
(18) At any time that the defendant becomes competent to stand trial, the clinical
director of the hospital or other facility or the executive director of the Department of Human
Services shall certify that fact to the court. The court shall conduct a hearing within 15
working days of the receipt of the clinical director's or executive director's report, unless the
court enlarges the time for good cause.
(19) The court may order a hearing or rehearing at any time on its own motion or upon
recommendations of the clinical director of the hospital or other facility or the executive
director of the Department of Human Services.
(20) Notice of a hearing on competency to stand trial shall be given to the prosecuting
attorney. If the hearing is held in the county where the defendant is confined, notice shall also
be given to the prosecuting attorney for that county.
Section 3. Section 77-15-6.5 is amended to read:
77-15-6.5. Petition for involuntary medication of incompetent defendant.
(1) As used in this section:
(a) "Executive director" means the executive director of the Department of Human
Services or the executive director's designee.
(b) "Final order" means a court order that determines the rights of the parties and
concerning which appellate remedies have been exhausted or the time for appeal has expired.
(2) (a) At any time after a defendant has been found incompetent to proceed and has
been committed to the Department of Human Services under Section 77-15-6 for treatment to
restore competency, the executive director shall notify the court, prosecuting attorney, and
attorney for the defendant if the executive director has determined that the defendant is not] \leftarrow \hat{H}

- 10 -

307	Ĥ→ [responding to treatment and is unlikely to be restored to competency without the involuntary
308	administration of antipsychotic medication.
309	(b) The executive director shall provide the notification under Subsection (2)(a) only if
310	there is no basis for involuntarily medicating the defendant for reasons other than to restore the
311	defendant's competency.
312	(3) In the notice under Subsection (2)(a), the executive director shall state whether the
313	executive director believes:
314	(a) medication is necessary to render the defendant competent;
315	(b) medication is substantially likely to render the defendant competent;
316	(c) medication is substantially unlikely to produce side effects which would
317	significantly interfere with the defendant's ability to assist in his defense;
318	(d) no less intrusive means are available, and whether any of those means have been
319	attempted to render the defendant competent; and
320	(e) medication is medically appropriate and is in the defendant's best medical interest
321	in light of his medical condition.
322	(4) (a) Upon receipt of the notice under Subsection (2)(a), the court shall conduct a
323	hearing within 30 days, unless the court extends the time for good cause, to determine whether
324	the court should convene a hearing regarding the involuntary medication of the defendant.
325	(b) The prosecuting attorney shall represent the state at any hearing under this section.
326	(c) The court shall consider whether the following factors apply in determining
327	whether the defendant should be involuntarily medicated:
328	(i) important state interests are at stake in restoring the defendant's competency;
329	(ii) involuntary medication will significantly further the important state interests, in
330	that the medication proposed:
331	(A) is substantially likely to render the defendant competent to stand trial; and
332	(B) is substantially unlikely to produce side effects which would significantly interfere
333	with the defendant's ability to assist the defense counsel in conducting his defense;
334	(iii) involuntary medication is necessary to further important state interests, because
335	any alternate less intrusive treatments are unlikely to achieve substantially the same results; and
336	(iv) the administration of the proposed medication is medically appropriate, as it is in
337	the defendant's best medical interest in light of his medical condition.] ←Ĥ

338	$\hat{\mathbf{H}} \rightarrow [-(5)]$ In determining whether the proposed treatment is medically appropriate and is in
339	the defendant's best medical interest, the potential penalty the defendant may be subject to, if
340	the defendant is convicted of any charged offense, is not a relevant consideration.
341	(6) (a) If the court finds by clear and convincing evidence that the involuntary
342	administration of antipsychotic medication is appropriate, it shall make findings addressing
343	each of the factors in Subsection (4)(c) and shall issue an order authorizing the Department of
344	Human Services to involuntarily administer antipsychotic medication to the defendant in order
345	to restore his competency, subject to the periodic reviews and other procedures provided in
346	Section 77-15-6.
347	(b) When issuing an order under Subsection (6)(a), the court shall consider ordering
348	less intrusive means for administering the drugs, such as a court order to the defendant
349	enforceable by the contempt power, before ordering more intrusive methods of involuntary
350	medication.
351	(7) The provisions in Section 77-15-6 establishing time limitations for treatment of
352	incompetent defendants before they must [be either released or civilly committed] <u>undergo</u>
353	$\underline{\text{civil commitment proceedings}} \text{ are tolled from the time the executive director gives notice to}$
354	the court and the parties under Subsection (2) until:
355	(a) the court has issued a final order for the involuntary medication of the defendant,
356	and the defendant has been medicated under that order; or
357	(b) the court has issued a final order that the defendant will not be involuntarily
358	medicated.
359	(8) This section applies only when the prosecution seeks an order of involuntary
360	medication solely for the purpose of rendering a defendant competent to proceed.] \leftarrow \hat{H}

Legislative Review Note as of 2-13-12 12:36 PM

Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel

- 12 -