

1 **INDIGENT DEFENSE COMMISSION AMENDMENTS**

2 2017 GENERAL SESSION

3 STATE OF UTAH

4 **Chief Sponsor: Todd Weiler**

5 House Sponsor: Craig Hall

7 **LONG TITLE**

8 **General Description:**

9 This bill modifies the Indigent Defense Act.

10 **Highlighted Provisions:**

11 This bill:

- 12 ▶ expands the Utah Indigent Defense Commission to include juvenile defense;
- 13 ▶ addresses the make up of the commission;
- 14 ▶ addresses the qualifications and duties of the director, including the hiring of staff;
- 15 ▶ addresses the powers and duties of the commission;
- 16 ▶ modifies provisions related to the Indigent Defense Resources Account;
- 17 ▶ addresses indigent criminal and juvenile defense system participation;
- 18 ▶ amends provisions related to application for grant money;
- 19 ▶ addresses cooperation with the commission; and
- 20 ▶ makes technical and conforming changes.

21 **Money Appropriated in this Bill:**

22 None

23 **Other Special Clauses:**

24 None

25 **Utah Code Sections Affected:**

26 **AMENDS:**

27 **77-32-801**, as enacted by Laws of Utah 2016, Chapter 177

28 **77-32-802**, as enacted by Laws of Utah 2016, Chapter 177

29 **77-32-803**, as enacted by Laws of Utah 2016, Chapter 177

- 30 [77-32-804](#), as enacted by Laws of Utah 2016, Chapter 177
- 31 [77-32-805](#), as enacted by Laws of Utah 2016, Chapter 177
- 32 [77-32-806](#), as enacted by Laws of Utah 2016, Chapter 177
- 33 [77-32-807](#), as enacted by Laws of Utah 2016, Chapter 177
- 34 [77-32-808](#), as enacted by Laws of Utah 2016, Chapter 177
- 35 [77-32-809](#), as enacted by Laws of Utah 2016, Chapter 177



37 *Be it enacted by the Legislature of the state of Utah:*

38 Section 1. Section **77-32-801** is amended to read:

39 **77-32-801. Indigent Defense Commission creation -- Purpose -- Definition.**

40 (1) There is created within the Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice the Utah
41 Indigent Defense Commission.

42 (2) The purpose of the commission is to assist the state in meeting the state's
43 obligations for the provision of indigent [~~criminal~~] defense services, consistent with the United
44 States Constitution, the Utah Constitution, and [~~this chapter~~] the Utah Code.

45 (3) Notwithstanding Section [77-32-201](#), for purposes of this part:

46 (a) "Indigent defense services" means the representation of indigent persons in
47 criminal, juvenile delinquency, and child welfare cases.

48 (b) "Indigent defense system" means indigent defense services provided by:

49 (i) local units of government, including a county, city, or town; or

50 (ii) a regional legal defense organization.

51 Section 2. Section **77-32-802** is amended to read:

52 **77-32-802. Commission members -- Membership qualifications -- Terms --**
53 **Vacancy -- Administrative support.**

54 (1) The commission is composed of [~~11~~] 13 voting and two ex officio, nonvoting
55 members.

56 (a) The governor, with the consent of the Senate, shall appoint the following [~~nine~~] 12
57 members:

58 (i) two practicing criminal defense attorneys and one attorney practicing in the area of
59 juvenile delinquency defense recommended by the Utah Association of Criminal Defense
60 Lawyers;

61 (ii) an attorney representing minority interests recommended by the Utah Minority Bar
62 Association;

63 (iii) one member recommended by the Utah Association of Counties from a county of
64 the first or second class;

65 (iv) one member recommended by the Utah Association of Counties from a county of
66 the third through sixth class;

67 (v) a director of a county public defender organization recommended by the Utah
68 Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers;

69 (vi) two members recommended by the Utah League of Cities and Towns from its
70 membership;

71 (vii) a retired judge recommended by the Judicial Council; ~~and~~

72 (viii) one member of the Utah Legislature selected jointly by the Speaker of the House
73 and President of the Senate[-]; and

74 (ix) one attorney practicing in the area of parental defense, recommended by an entity
75 funded under Title 63A, Chapter 11, Child Welfare Parental Defense Program.

76 (b) The executive director of the Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice or the
77 executive director's designee shall be a voting member of the commission.

78 (c) The ex officio, nonvoting members of the commission are:

79 (i) the director of the [~~Utah Indigent Defense Commission~~] commission appointed in
80 Section ~~77-32-803~~; and

81 (ii) a representative from the Administrative Office of the Courts appointed by the
82 Judicial Council.

83 (2) Members appointed by the governor shall serve four-year terms, except as provided
84 in Subsection (3).

85 (3) The governor shall stagger the initial terms of appointees so that approximately half

86 of the commission is appointed every two years.

87 (4) Members appointed to the commission shall have significant experience in indigent
88 criminal defense, child welfare parental defense, or juvenile defense in delinquency
89 proceedings or have otherwise demonstrated a strong commitment to providing effective
90 representation in indigent [~~criminal~~] defense services.

91 (5) A person who is currently employed solely as a criminal prosecuting attorney may
92 not serve as a member of the commission.

93 [~~(5)~~] (6) Commission members shall hold office until their successors are appointed.

94 [~~(6)~~] (7) The commission may remove a member for incompetence, dereliction of duty,
95 malfeasance, misfeasance, or nonfeasance in office, or for any other good cause.

96 [~~(7)~~] (8) When a vacancy occurs in the membership for any reason, a replacement shall
97 be appointed for the remaining unexpired term in the same manner as the original appointment.

98 [~~(8)~~] (9) The governor shall appoint one of the initial commission members to serve as
99 chair of the commission for a term of one year. At the expiration of that year, or upon the
100 vacancy in the membership of the appointed chair, the commission shall annually elect a chair
101 from the commission's membership to serve a one-year term. A commission member may not
102 serve as chair of the commission for more than three consecutive terms.

103 [~~(9)~~] (10) A member may not receive compensation or benefits for the member's
104 service, but may receive per diem and travel expenses in accordance with:

105 (a) Section 63A-3-106;

106 (b) Section 63A-3-107; and

107 (c) rules made by the Division of Finance pursuant to Sections 63A-3-106 and
108 63A-3-107.

109 [~~(10)~~] (11) Six members constitute a quorum, however, the affirmative vote of at least
110 six members of the commission is required for official action of the commission.

111 Section 3. Section 77-32-803 is amended to read:

112 **77-32-803. Director -- Qualifications -- Staff.**

113 (1) The commission shall appoint a director to carry out the following duties:

114 (a) establish an annual budget;
115 (b) assist the commission in ~~[developing and regularly reviewing advisory caseload~~
116 ~~guidelines and procedures, including recommending to the commission suggested changes to~~
117 ~~the criteria for an indigent defendant's eligibility to receive criminal defense services under this~~
118 ~~chapter; and] the performance of the commission's statutory duties;~~

119 (c) assist the commission in developing and regularly reviewing advisory caseload
120 guidelines and procedures, including recommending to the commission suggested changes to
121 the criteria for an indigent person's eligibility to receive defense services under this chapter;
122 and

123 ~~[(c)]~~ (d) perform all other duties as assigned.

124 (2) The director shall be ~~[a full-time licensed attorney]~~ an active member of the Utah
125 State Bar with an appropriate background and experience to serve as the full-time director.

126 (3) The director shall hire staff as necessary to carry out the duties of the commission,
127 including ~~[at least one individual with data collection and analysis skills to carry out duties as~~
128 ~~outlined in Subsection 77-32-804(1)(a).]~~:

129 (a) one individual who is an active member of the Utah State Bar to serve as a full-time
130 assistant director; and

131 (b) one individual with data collection and analysis skills to carry out duties as outlined
132 in Subsection 77-32-804(1)(a).

133 (4) The commission in appointing the director, and the director in hiring the assistant
134 director, shall give a preference to individuals with experience in adult criminal defense, child
135 welfare parental defense, or juvenile delinquency defense.

136 Section 4. Section **77-32-804** is amended to read:

137 **77-32-804. Powers and duties of the commission -- Annual report.**

138 (1) The commission shall:

139 (a) develop and adopt guiding principles for the assessment and oversight of ~~[criminal]~~
140 indigent defense systems with the state that, at a minimum, address the following:

141 (i) Indigent defense service providers shall have independent judgment without fear of

142 retaliation.

143 (ii) Service providers shall provide conflict-free representation, including the need for a
144 separate contract for conflict counsel.

145 (iii) Service providers shall provide contracts that separately account for indigent
146 criminal defense, parental defense, and juvenile delinquency defense.

147 ~~[(iii)]~~ (iv) The state may not interfere with the service provider's access to clients and
148 the service provider is free to defend the client based on the service provider's own independent
149 judgment[-];

150 ~~[(iv)]~~ (A) Accused persons in criminal cases shall be provided counsel at all critical
151 stages ~~[of the criminal process]~~.

152 (B) Indigent parties in juvenile delinquency and child welfare proceedings shall be
153 provided counsel at all stages.

154 ~~[(v)]~~ (v) Counsel shall be free to provide meaningful~~[-, adversarial testing of the~~
155 ~~evidence]~~ representation, including:

156 (A) adequate access to defense resources; and

157 (B) workloads that allow for time to meet with clients, investigate cases, and file
158 appropriate motions.

159 ~~[(vi)]~~ (vi) Service providers shall be fairly compensated and incentivized to represent
160 clients fully through:

161 (A) compensation, that shall be independent from prosecutors' compensation;

162 (B) incentives that are structured to effectively represent ~~[criminal defendants well;~~
163 ~~and]~~ indigent persons;

164 (C) contract provisions that address legal training and education in the areas of the law
165 relevant to the types of cases the service provider is contracted to appear on;

166 ~~[(E)]~~ (D) separate contracts ~~[that are offered]~~ for appellate attorneys to ensure the right
167 to appeal[-]; and

168 (E) compensation sufficient to attract applicants qualified with adequate experience in
169 the relevant areas of the law to provide effective representation in the defense of clients.

170 (vii) Contracts that address counsel's obligation under the Utah Rules of Professional
171 Conduct, including expectations on client communications and managing conflicts of interest.

172 [~~vii~~] (viii) The commission may maintain oversight to collect data, audit attorney
173 performance, establish standards, and enforce the principles listed [~~above~~] in this Subsection
174 (1)(a);

175 (b) identify and collect data necessary for the commission to:

176 (i) review compliance by [~~criminal~~] indigent defense systems of minimum principles
177 for effective representation;

178 (ii) establish procedures for the collection and analysis of the data; and

179 (iii) provide reports regarding the operation of the commission and the provision of
180 indigent [~~criminal~~] defense services by each indigent [~~criminal~~] defense system;

181 (c) develop and oversee the establishment of advisory caseload principles and
182 guidelines to aid indigent [~~criminal~~] defense systems in delivering effective representation in
183 the state consistent with the safeguards of the United States Constitution, the Utah
184 Constitution, and [~~this chapter~~] the Utah Code;

185 (d) review [~~all~~] contracts and interlocal agreements in the state for the provision of
186 indigent [~~criminal~~] defense services and provide assistance and recommendations regarding
187 compliance with minimum principles for effective representation of indigent individuals in
188 court;

189 (e) investigate, audit, and review the provision of indigent [~~criminal~~] defense services
190 for compliance with minimum principles;

191 (f) establish procedures for the receipt, acceptance, and resolution of complaints
192 regarding the provision of indigent [~~criminal~~] defense services;

193 (g) establish procedures that enable indigent [~~criminal~~] defense systems to apply for
194 state funding as provided under Section [77-32-805](#);

195 (h) establish procedures for annually reporting to the governor, Legislature, and
196 Judicial Council, [~~and indigent criminal defense systems throughout the state that~~] which
197 include reporting the following:

- 198 (i) the operations of the commission;
- 199 (ii) the operations of each indigent [~~criminal~~] defense system to which the commission
200 has granted money; and
- 201 (iii) the compliance by each indigent [~~criminal~~] defense [~~system's compliance~~] system
202 that has received a grant of money from the commission, with minimum [~~standards~~] principles
203 for the provision of indigent [~~criminal~~] defense services and for effective representation of
204 indigent individuals in court;
- 205 (i) award grants to indigent [~~criminal~~] defense systems consistent with metrics
206 established by the commission under this part and appropriations by the state;
- 207 (j) encourage and aid in the regionalization of indigent [~~criminal~~] defense services
208 within the state for effective representation and for efficiency and cost savings to local
209 systems;
- 210 (k) submit to legislative, executive, and judicial leadership, from time to time,
211 proposed recommendations for improvement in the provision of indigent [~~criminal~~] defense
212 services to ensure effective representation in the state, consistent with the safeguards of the
213 United States Constitution [~~and~~], the Utah Constitution, and the Utah Code; and
- 214 (l) identify and encourage best practices for effective representation [~~to indigent~~
215 ~~defendants charged with crimes~~].
- 216 (2) The commission shall emphasize the importance of effective indigent [~~criminal~~]
217 defense services [~~provided to defendants, whether charged with a misdemeanor or felony~~].
- 218 (3) The commission shall establish procedures for the conduct of the commission's
219 affairs and internal policies necessary to carry out the commission's duties and responsibilities
220 under this part.
- 221 (4) Commission policies shall be [~~placed in an appropriate manual,~~] made publicly
222 available on a website[, ~~and made available to all attorneys and professionals providing~~
223 ~~indigent criminal defense services, the Judicial Council, the governor, and the Legislature~~].
- 224 (5) The delivery of indigent [~~criminal~~] defense services shall be independent of the
225 judiciary, but the commission shall ensure that judges are permitted and encouraged to

226 contribute information and advice concerning the delivery of indigent [~~criminal~~] defense
227 services.

228 (6) The commission may make rules in accordance with Title 63G, Chapter 3, Utah
229 Administrative Rulemaking Act, to establish guiding principles for the constitutional provision
230 of indigent defense services in the state.

231 [~~(6)~~] (7) An indigent [~~criminal~~] defense system that is in compliance with minimum
232 principles and procedures may not be required to provide indigent [~~criminal~~] defense services
233 in excess of those principles and procedures.

234 [~~(7)~~] (8) The commission shall [~~submit a~~] report annually to the Judiciary Interim
235 Committee on the commission's efforts to improve the provision of indigent [~~criminal~~] defense
236 services statewide.

237 Section 5. Section **77-32-805** is amended to read:

238 **77-32-805. Indigent Defense Resources Account -- Administration.**

239 (1) For purposes of this part, "account" means the Indigent Defense Resources
240 Account.

241 (2) (a) There is created within the General Fund a restricted account known as the
242 "Indigent Defense Resources Restricted Account."

243 (b) [~~Funds~~] Money in the account shall be nonlapsing.

244 (c) Subject to appropriation, [~~funds~~] money from the account shall be disbursed by the
245 [~~Utah Indigent Defense Commission~~] commission in accordance with [~~the provisions of this~~
246 ~~chapter~~] this part.

247 (3) The account consists of:

248 (a) [~~funds~~] money appropriated by the Legislature based upon recommendations from
249 the commission consistent with principles of shared state and local funding;

250 (b) other [~~moneys~~] money received by the commission pursuant to Subsection
251 **77-32-809(3)**; and

252 (c) interest and earnings from the investment of account [~~funds~~] money.

253 (4) [~~Funds~~] Money from the account shall be invested by the state treasurer with the

254 earnings and interest accruing to the account.

255 (5) The account shall be administered by the commission for:

256 (a) the establishment and maintenance of a statewide indigent [~~criminal~~] defense data
257 collection system;

258 (b) grants to indigent [~~criminal~~] defense systems for defense resources; and

259 (c) grants to indigent [~~criminal~~] defense systems for defense services providers.

260 (6) Money allocated to or deposited into the account shall be used:

261 (a) to reimburse participating systems for commission-approved expenditures for the
262 purposes listed in Subsection (5); and

263 (b) for administrative costs.

264 Section 6. Section ~~77-32-806~~ is amended to read:

265 **77-32-806. Indigent and juvenile defense system participation.**

266 (1) To qualify for grant [~~funds~~] money described in Subsection ~~77-32-805~~(5), the
267 legislative body responsible for an indigent [~~criminal~~] defense system shall:

268 (a) adopt a resolution stating the intent to apply for grant [~~funds~~] money from the
269 account and committing that the indigent [~~criminal~~] defense system shall meet minimum
270 principles for the effective representation of indigent individuals in court; and

271 (b) submit a certified copy of that resolution together with an application to the
272 commission.

273 (2) The commission may revoke an indigent [~~criminal~~] defense system's grant award if
274 the system fails to meet minimum principles for the effective representation of indigent
275 individuals in court or other grant conditions established by the commission.

276 Section 7. Section ~~77-32-807~~ is amended to read:

277 **77-32-807. Application for grant money.**

278 (1) Applications for grant [~~moneys~~] money from the commission may seek resources
279 for the following expenses:

280 (a) establishment and maintenance of an indigent [~~criminal~~] defense data collection
281 system;

282 (b) defense resources;

283 (c) matching ~~[fund]~~ money grants for defense services providers; and

284 (d) critical need grants for defense services providers.

285 (2) (a) Matching ~~[fund]~~ money grants, as described in Subsection (1)(c), may be

286 awarded if the indigent ~~[criminal]~~ defense system spends an amount greater than the system's

287 baseline budget, as described in Subsection 77-32-809(2)(a), for defense services providers.

288 (b) For the purposes of Subsection (2)(a), matching ~~[funds is an amount equal to the~~

289 product of] money grants may be awarded by the commission in an amount up to:

290 (i) for a city or town, the indigent ~~[criminal]~~ defense system's spending above the

291 system's baseline budget; and

292 (ii) for a county, the product of the indigent defense system's spending above the

293 system's baseline budget and:

294 (A) 50% for counties of the first class;

295 (B) 100% for counties of the second or third class; or

296 (C) 200% for counties of the fourth through sixth class.

297 (3) Critical need grant ~~[moneys]~~ money, as described in Subsection (1)(d), may be

298 awarded if the indigent ~~[criminal]~~ defense system can demonstrate to the commission's

299 satisfaction that:

300 (a) the system has incurred or reasonably anticipates incurring expenses in excess of

301 the system's annual local funding, as adjusted for population growth and inflation;

302 (b) the funding for the expenses described in Subsection (3)(a) is necessary for the

303 indigent ~~[criminal]~~ defense system to meet minimum ~~[standards]~~ principles for effective

304 representation; and

305 (c) increasing the system's local share for indigent ~~[criminal]~~ defense providers would

306 constitute an undue burden on the indigent ~~[criminal]~~ defense system.

307 (4) If the application of a participating indigent ~~[criminal]~~ defense system is approved

308 by the commission, the director of the commission shall negotiate, enter into, and administer a

309 contract with the participating indigent ~~[criminal]~~ defense system for the purposes listed in

310 Subsection (1).

311 (5) Nonparticipating systems remain responsible for meeting minimum principles for
312 effective representation but may not be eligible for any legislative relief.

313 (6) A county or municipality may not be required to increase the county or
314 municipality's certified tax rate pursuant to Section 59-2-924 to participate in the fund.

315 Section 8. Section 77-32-808 is amended to read:

316 **77-32-808. Annual report, budget, and listing of expenditures -- Availability on**
317 **website.**

318 (1) As used in this section, "expenditures" means all payments or disbursements of
319 commission ~~[funds]~~ money, received from any source, made by the commission.

320 (2) The commission shall publish and make available to the public on a website the
321 commission's annual report, budget, salary information, a listing of all expenditures, and a list
322 of all indigent ~~[criminal]~~ defense systems.

323 (3) Publication and availability of the listing of expenditures shall be on a quarterly
324 basis. The commission's budget and salary information may be published and made available
325 on an annual basis.

326 Section 9. Section 77-32-809 is amended to read:

327 **77-32-809. Investigation, audit, and review of indigent and juvenile defense**
328 **services -- Cooperation and participation with commission -- Maintenance of local share**
329 **-- Necessity for excess funding.**

330 (1) ~~[All indigent criminal]~~ Indigent defense systems and attorneys engaged in
331 providing indigent ~~[criminal]~~ defense services shall cooperate and participate with the
332 commission in the investigation, audit, and review of all indigent ~~[criminal]~~ defense services.

333 (2) (a) For purposes of this part, "baseline budget" means an indigent ~~[criminal]~~
334 defense system's ~~[share of local funding, adjusted annually for growth in population and~~
335 ~~inflation]~~ annual expenditure for the indigent defense services. The baseline budget shall be
336 adjusted for indigent defense case load fluctuations and inflations whenever subsequent grant
337 requests are submitted to the commission.

338 (b) An indigent [~~criminal~~] defense system shall maintain the system's baseline budget
339 each year.

340 (c) If the commission determines that [~~funding~~] money in excess of the indigent
341 [~~criminal~~] defense system's baseline budget is necessary to achieve minimum principles for
342 effective representation, the excess [~~funding~~] money shall be paid from state or local funding,
343 or a combination of both, as determined by the grant application process described in Section
344 [77-32-807](#).

345 (d) An indigent [~~criminal~~] defense system is not required to expend all of the system's
346 local funding if minimum principles for effective representation may be met for less than local
347 funding.

348 (3) The commission may apply for and obtain state funding from any source to carry
349 out the purposes of this part. [~~All funds~~] Money received by the commission, from any source,
350 are state funds and shall be appropriated as provided by law.